

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON

In the Matter of the Search of  
the patient records located,  
on March 2, 2010, in a safe at  
35 West Third Avenue  
Williamson, West Virginia

Case No. 2:10-mj-00037

RESPONSE OF THE UNITED STATES TO  
MOTION TO VACATE SEARCH AND SEIZURE WARRANT  
OF MARCH 1, 2010 AND FOR REMEDIAL ACTION

Comes now the United States of America, by Monica K. Schwartz,  
Assistant United States Attorney for the Southern District of West  
Virginia, with its response to Katherine A. Hoover's ("Movant")  
"Motion to Vacate Search and Seizure Warrant of March 1, 2010 and  
for Remedial Action." Movant's motion is properly considered as  
a motion to return property pursuant to Federal Rule of Criminal  
Procedure 41(g), which provides as follows:

**(g) Motion to Return Property.** A person aggrieved by an  
unlawful search and seizure of property or by the  
deprivation of property may move for the property's  
return. The motion must be filed in the district court  
where the property was seized. The Court must receive  
evidence on any factual issue necessary to decide the  
motion. If it grants the motion, the court must return  
the property to the movant, but may impose reasonable  
conditions to protect access to the property and its use  
in later proceedings.

Movant requests "that this Court vacate the search warrant  
signed on March 1, 2010" and "return everything that was taken."  
Pursuant to this Court's order, and the very style of the pending  
motion, the relevant warrant was issued on March 2, 2010, in this

case, Case No. 2:10-mj-00037, and authorized only the search and seizure of eight patient records.

It is not clear how the movant was "aggrieved" by the seizure of the patient records. Movant alleges generally that the search and seizure warrant was fraudulent and/or otherwise improper but offers no specific factual arguments relating to these files. Further, movant has offered no relevant legal authority to support these contentions.

The patient records at issue were located, on March 2, 2010, in a safe, at 35 West Third Avenue, Williamson, West Virginia, during the execution of a search warrant which had been issued on February 26, 2010, in Case No. 2:10-mj-00032.

The specific patient records seized were listed in the affidavit supporting the search warrant, in Case No. 2:10-mj-00037.

Pursuant to Rule 41(g) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, a motion for return of property "may be denied if the [movant] is not entitled to the lawful possession of the seized property, the property is contraband or subject to forfeiture or the government's need for the property as evidence continues." United States v. Rudisill, 358 F. Appx 421 (4th Cir. 2009)(citing United States v. Van Cauwenberghe, 934 F.2d 1048, 1060-61 (9th Cir. 1991)). Movant has not asserted or demonstrated that she is entitled to possession of the seized patient records. Furthermore, the United States has an ongoing investigation related to the

medical practice from which the patient records were seized. The seized patient files are relevant thereto and are, therefore, needed by the United States.

Movant's motion fails to specify how movant is "aggrieved" by the seizure of the patient records and further, it cites no relevant factual argument or legal authority. The seizure of the patient records was, in fact, proper as they were within the scope of a duly issued search warrant. Further, the United States has a continuing need for the files.

Wherefore, Movant's motion should be denied.

To the extent that there is any factual determination necessary for the court to rule on movant's request to "return" the seized patient records, the United States requests that this Court schedule an evidentiary hearing and require defendant to appear in person.

Respectfully submitted,

R. BOOTH GOODWIN II  
United States Attorney

By:

s/Monica K. Schwartz  
MONICA K. SCHWARTZ Bar Number: 4938  
Assistant U.S. Attorney  
P.O. Box 1713  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Telephone: (304) 345-2200  
Fax: (304) 347-5104  
E-mail: [monica.schwartz@usdoj.gov](mailto:monica.schwartz@usdoj.gov)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

It is hereby certified that the foregoing "Response of the United States to Motion to Vacate Search and Seizure Warrant of March 1, 2010 and for Remedial Action" has been electronically filed and service has been made on Movant by federal expressing the same this the 28<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2010, to:

Katherine A. Hoover, M.D.  
C/O Dr. Norman Gay  
247 West Bay Street  
Nassau, Bahamas

s/Monica K. Schwartz  
MONICA K. SCHWARTZ Bar Number: 4938  
Assistant U.S. Attorney  
P.O. Box 1713  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Telephone: (304) 345-2200  
Fax: (304) 347-5104  
E-mail: [monica.schwartz@usdoj.gov](mailto:monica.schwartz@usdoj.gov)